

CALIFORNIA TAX CREDIT ALLOCATION COMMITTEE
Project Staff Report
2011 Second Round
September 28, 2011

Project Number CA-2011-150

Project Name Tobias Terrace Apartments
Site Address: 9246 Tobias Avenue & 9247-9257 Van Nuys Blvd.
Panorama City, CA 91402 County: Los Angeles
Census Tract: 1193.200

Tax Credit Amounts	Federal/Annual	State/Total
Requested:	\$768,012	\$0
Recommended:	\$768,012	\$0

Applicant Information

Applicant: Tobias Terrace Apartments, L.P.
Contact: Aaron Mandel
Address: 1640 S. Sepulveda Blvd., Suite 425
Los Angeles, CA 90025
Phone: 310-575-3543 Fax: 310-575-3563
Email: amandel@metahousing.com

General partner(s) or principal owner(s): Tobias Terrace Apartments, LLC.
WCH Affordable V, LLC
General Partner Type: Joint Venture
Developer: Meta Housing Corp.
Investor/Consultant: The Richman Group
Management Agent: Solari Enterprises, Inc.

Project Information

Construction Type: New Construction
Total # Residential Buildings: 1
Total # of Units: 56
No. & % of Tax Credit Units: 55 100%
Federal Set-Aside Elected: 40%/60%
Federal Subsidy: HOME
Utility Allowance: CUAC
Affordability Breakdown by Units and % (Lowest Income Points):
30% AMI: 6 10 %
40% AMI: 12 20 %
50% AMI: 37 40 %

Information

Set-Aside: N/A
 Housing Type: Large Family
 Geographic Area: Los Angeles County
 TCAC Project Analyst: Velia M. Greenwood

Unit Mix

38 1-Bedroom Units
 18 3-Bedroom Units

 56 Total Units

<u>Unit Type & Number</u>	<u>2011 Rents Targeted % of Area Median Income</u>	<u>2011 Rents Actual % of Area Median Income</u>	<u>Proposed Rent (including utilities)</u>
4 1 Bedroom	30%	30%	\$480
12 1 Bedroom	40%	40%	\$640
22 1 Bedroom	50%	48%	\$768
2 3 Bedrooms	30%	30%	\$666
15 3 Bedrooms	50%	44%	\$960
1 3 Bedrooms	Manager's Unit	Manager's Unit	\$1,332

Project Financing

Estimated Total Project Cost: \$15,629,080
 Estimated Residential Project Cost: \$15,629,080

Residential

Construction Cost Per Square Foot: \$166
 Per Unit Cost: \$279,091

Construction Financing

<u>Source</u>	<u>Amount</u>
Wells Fargo	\$1,500,000
CRA/LA	\$2,500,000
LAHD - HOME	\$4,656,000
Deferred Developer Fee	\$1,228,352
Tax Credit Equity	\$5,744,728

Permanent Financing

<u>Source</u>	<u>Amount</u>
CCRC	\$1,609,897
CRA/LA	\$2,500,000
LAHD - HOME	\$4,656,000
Deferred Developer Fee	\$104,680
Tax Credit Equity	\$6,758,503
TOTAL	\$15,629,080

Determination of Credit Amount(s)

Requested Eligible Basis: \$6,564,206
 130% High Cost Adjustment: Yes
 Applicable Fraction: 100.00%
 Qualified Basis: \$8,533,467
 Applicable Rate: 9.00%
 Total Maximum Annual Federal Credit: \$768,012
 Approved Developer Fee in Project Cost: \$1,500,000
 Approved Developer Fee in Eligible Basis: \$1,400,000
 Investor/Consultant: The Richman Group
 Federal Tax Credit Factor: \$0.88000

Per Regulation Section 10322(i)(4)(A), The “as if vacant” land value and the existing improvement value established at application, as well as the eligible basis amount derived from those values, will be used during all subsequent reviews including the placed in service review, for the purpose of determining the final award of Tax Credits.

Per Regulation Section 10327(c)(2)(C), Once established at the initial funded application, the developer fee cannot be increased, but may be decreased, in the event of a modification in basis.

Eligible Basis and Basis Limit

Requested Unadjusted Eligible Basis:	\$6,564,206
Actual Eligible Basis:	\$12,102,136
Unadjusted Threshold Basis Limit:	\$11,431,988
Total Adjusted Threshold Basis Limit:	\$14,050,986

Adjustments to Basis Limit:

Required to Pay Prevailing Wages
Local Development Impact Fees

Tie-Breaker Information

First:	Large Family
Second:	65.032%

Cost Analysis and Line Item Review

Staff analysis of project costs to determine reasonableness found all fees to be within TCAC’s underwriting guidelines and TCAC limitations. Annual operating expenses exceed the minimum operating expenses established in the Regulations, and the project pro forma shows a positive cash flow from year one. Staff has calculated federal tax credits based on 9.00% of the qualified basis, or, in the case of acquisition credit or credit combined with federal subsidies, 3.40%. Applicants are cautioned to consider the expected federal rate when negotiating with investors. TCAC's financial evaluation at project completion will determine the final allocation.

Special Issues/Other Significant Information: None.

Legal Status: Staff has reviewed the Applicant's responses to the questions contained in the Legal Status portion of the Application. No information was disclosed that raised any question regarding the financial viability or legal integrity of the applicant.

Local Reviewing Agency:

The Local Reviewing Agency, Los Angeles Housing Department, has completed a site review of this project and strongly supports this project.

Recommendation: Staff recommends that the Committee make a preliminary reservation of tax credits in the following amount(s) contingent upon standard conditions and any additional conditions imposed by the Committee:

Federal Tax Credits/Annual
\$768,012

State Tax Credits/Total
\$0

Standard Conditions

The applicant must submit all documentation required for a Carryover Allocation, any Readiness 180-Day Requirements elected, and a Final Reservation. Failure to provide the documentation at the time required may result in rescission of the Credit reservation and cancellation of a carryover allocation.

TCAC makes the preliminary reservation only for the project specified above in the form presented, and involving the parties referred to in the application. No changes in the development team or the project as presented will be permitted without the express approval of TCAC.

The applicant must pay TCAC a performance deposit and allocation fee calculated in accordance with regulation. Additionally, TCAC requires the project owner to pay a monitoring fee before issuance of tax forms.

As project costs are preliminary estimates only, staff recommends that a reservation be made in the amount of federal credit and state credit shown above on condition that the final project costs be supported by itemized lender approved costs and certified costs after the buildings are placed in service.

All unexpended funds in reserve accounts established for the project must remain with the project to be used for the benefit of the property and/or its residents, except for the portion of any accounts funded with deferred developer fees.

All fees charged to the project must be within TCAC limitations. Fees in excess of these limitations will not be considered when determining the amount of credit when the project is placed-in-service.

The applicant/owner shall be subject to underwriting criteria set forth in Section 10327 of the regulations through the final feasibility analysis performed by TCAC at placed-in-service.

Credit awards are contingent upon applicant's acceptance of any revised total project cost, qualified basis and tax credit amount determined by TCAC in its final feasibility analysis.

The applicant must ensure the project meets all Additional Threshold Requirements of the proposed project. If points were awarded for service amenities, the applicant will be required to provide such amenity or amenities identified in the application, for a minimum period of ten years and at no cost to the tenants. Applicants that received points for sustainable building methods (energy efficiency) must submit the certification required by Section 10325(c)(6) at project completion. Applicants that received increases (exceptions to limits) in the threshold basis limit under Section 10327(c)(5) must submit the certification required by Section 10322(i)(2) at project completion.

Additional Conditions: None.

Points System	Max. Possible Points	Requested Points	Points Awarded
Cost Efficiency / Credit Reduction / Public Funds	20	20	20
Public Funds	20	20	20
Owner / Management Characteristics	9	9	9
General Partner Experience	6	6	6
Management Experience	3	3	3
Housing Needs	10	10	10
Site Amenities	15	15	15
Within ¼ mile of transit stop, service every 30 min, 25 units/acre density	7	7	7
Within ¼ mile of public park or community center open to general public	3	3	3
Within 1.5 miles of a full-scale grocery/supermarket of at least 25,000 sf	3	3	3
Large Family proj. w/ ½ mile of public school project children may attend	2	2	0
Within 1 mile of medical clinic or hospital	2	2	2
Service Amenities	10	10	10
LARGE FAMILY, SENIOR, AT-RISK HOUSING TYPES			
Adult ed/health & wellness/skill bldg classes, minimum 84 hrs/yr instruction	7	7	7
Health & wellness services and programs, minimum 60 hrs per 100 bdrms	3	3	3
Sustainable Building Methods	10	10	10
NEW CONSTRUCTION/ADAPTIVE REUSE			
Develop project in accordance w/ requirements of: LEED	5	5	5
Develop project to requirements of: LEED Gold	5	5	5
Lowest Income	52	52	52
Basic Targeting	50	50	50
Deeper Targeting – at least 10% of units @ 30% AMI or less	2	2	2
Readiness to Proceed	20	20	20
Miscellaneous Federal and State Policies	2	2	2
State Credit Substitution	2	2	2
Total Points	148	148	148

Please Note: If more than the maximum Site Amenity points were requested, not all amenities may have been scored and/or verified.

DO NOT RELY ON SCORING IN THIS COMPETITIVE CYCLE FOR FUTURE APPLICATIONS. ALL RE-APPLICATIONS ARE REVIEWED WITHOUT RELIANCE ON PAST SCORING.