

**CALIFORNIA TAX CREDIT ALLOCATION COMMITTEE**

**Project Staff Report**

**2017 First Round**

**June 7, 2017**

**REVISED**

Kings Canyon, located at 5271 E. Kings Canyon Road in Fresno, requested and is being recommended for a reservation of \$803,185 in annual federal tax credits to finance the acquisition and rehabilitation of 74 units of housing serving large families with rents affordable to households earning 30-60% of area median income (AMI). The project will be developed by Thomas Safran & Associates Development, Inc. and is located in Senate District 8 and Assembly District 31.

The project is currently at-risk, but is being recommended for a reservation of tax credits that will be preserve affordability for an additional 55 years. The project will be receiving rental assistance in the form of HUD Section 8 Project-based Contract.

**Project Number** CA-17-075

**Project Name** Kings Canyon  
Site Address: 5271 E. Kings Canyon Road  
Fresno, CA 93727 County: Fresno  
Census Tract: 30.030

<b>Tax Credit Amounts</b>	<b>Federal/Annual</b>	<b>State/Total</b>
Requested:	\$803,185	\$0
Recommended:	\$803,185	\$0

**Applicant Information**

Applicant: Thomas Safran & Associates Development, Inc.  
Contact: Anthony Yannatta  
Address: 11812 San Vicente Blvd., Ste. 600  
Los Angeles, CA 90049  
Phone: 310-820-4888 Fax: 310-207-6986  
Email: anthony@tsahousing.com

General Partner(s) / Principal Owner(s): Housing Corporation of America  
Thomas Safran & Associates  
General Partner Type: Joint Venture  
Parent Company(ies): Housing Corporation of America  
Thomas Safran & Associates  
Developer: Thomas Safran & Associates Development, Inc.  
Investor/Consultant: Wells Fargo  
Management Agent(s): Thomas Safran & Associates, Inc.

**Project Information**

Construction Type: Acquisition & Rehabilitation  
 Total # Residential Buildings: 17  
 Total # of Units: 74  
 No. & % of Tax Credit Units: 73 100%  
 Federal Set-Aside Elected: 40%/60%  
 Federal Subsidy: HUD Section 8 Project-based Contract - (65 units 88%)  
 Affordability Breakdown by Units and % (Lowest Income Points):  
 30% AMI: 8 10 %  
 40% AMI: 15 20 %  
 50% AMI: 30 40 %

**Information**

Set-Aside: At-Risk  
 Housing Type: Large Family  
 Geographic Area: Central Valley Region  
 TCAC Project Analyst: Marlene McDonough

**Unit Mix**

8 1-Bedroom Units  
 48 2-Bedroom Units  
 18 3-Bedroom Units  


---

 74 Total Units

<u>Unit Type &amp; Number</u>	<u>2016 Rents Targeted % of Area Median Income</u>	<u>2016 Rents Actual % of Area Median Income</u>	<u>Proposed Rent (including utilities)</u>
1 1 Bedroom	30%	30%	\$331
1 1 Bedroom	40%	40%	\$442
5 1 Bedroom	50%	50%	\$553
1 1 Bedroom	60%	60%	\$663
5 2 Bedrooms	30%	30%	\$398
12 2 Bedrooms	40%	40%	\$531
20 2 Bedrooms	50%	50%	\$663
9 2 Bedrooms	60%	60%	\$796
2 2 Bedrooms	60%	60%	\$796
2 3 Bedrooms	30%	30%	\$459
2 3 Bedrooms	40%	40%	\$613
5 3 Bedrooms	50%	50%	\$766
3 3 Bedrooms	60%	60%	\$919
5 3 Bedrooms	60%	60%	\$919
1 3 Bedrooms	Manager's Unit	Manager's Unit	\$0

Projected Lifetime Rent Benefit: \$13,122,384

**Project Cost Summary at Application**

Land and Acquisition	\$5,000,000
Construction Costs	\$0
Rehabilitation Costs	\$5,365,000
Construction Contingency	\$536,500
Relocation	\$74,000
Architectural/Engineering	\$207,500
Const. Interest, Perm. Financing	\$498,775
Legal Fees, Appraisals	\$92,735
Reserves	\$193,136
Other Costs	\$600,624
Developer Fee	\$1,700,937
Commercial Costs	\$0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$14,269,207</b>

**Project Financing**

Estimated Total Project Cost:	\$14,269,207
Estimated Residential Project Cost:	\$14,269,207
Estimated Commercial Project Cost:	\$0

**Residential**

Construction Cost Per Square Foot:	\$83
Per Unit Cost:	\$192,827
True Cash Per Unit Cost*:	\$189,811

**Construction Financing**

Source	Amount
PNC Bank - Tranche A	\$3,229,971
PNC Bank - Tranche B	\$2,671,729
NOI During Construction	\$313,288
Deferred Developer Fee	\$1,700,937
Tax Credit Equity	\$6,353,282

**Permanent Financing**

Source	Amount
PNC Bank - Tranche A	\$3,229,971
PNC Bank - Tranche B	\$2,671,729
NOI During Construction	\$313,288
Deferred Developer Fee	\$223,165
Tax Credit Equity	\$7,831,054
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$14,269,207</b>

\*Less Donated Land, Fee Waivers, Seller Carryback Loans, and Deferred Developer Fee

**Determination of Credit Amount(s)**

Requested Eligible Basis (Rehabilitation):	\$6,865,514
130% High Cost Adjustment:	Yes
Applicable Fraction:	100.00%
Qualified Basis (Rehabilitation):	\$8,925,168
Applicable Rate:	9.00%
Total Maximum Annual Federal Credit:	\$803,185
Approved Developer Fee in Project Cost:	\$1,700,937
Approved Developer Fee in Eligible Basis:	\$1,250,937
Investor/Consultant:	Wells Fargo
Federal Tax Credit Factor:	\$0.97500

Per Regulation Section 10322(i)(4)(A), The “as if vacant” land value and the existing improvement value established at application, as well as the eligible basis amount derived from those values, will be used during all subsequent reviews including the placed in service review, for the purpose of determining the final award of Tax Credits.

Per Regulation Section 10327(c)(2)(C), Once established at the initial funded application, the developer fee cannot be increased, but may be decreased, in the event of a modification in basis.

**Eligible Basis and Basis Limit**

Requested Unadjusted Eligible Basis:	\$6,865,514
Actual Eligible Basis:	\$12,590,514
Unadjusted Threshold Basis Limit:	\$19,635,480
Total Adjusted Threshold Basis Limit:	\$19,635,480

**Adjustments to Basis Limit:** None.

**Tie-Breaker Information**

First:	<b>Large Family</b>
Final:	<b>40.187%</b>

**Cost Analysis and Line Item Review**

Staff analysis of project costs to determine reasonableness found all fees to be within TCAC’s underwriting guidelines and TCAC limitations. Annual operating expenses exceed the minimum operating expenses established in the Regulations, and the project pro forma shows a positive cash flow from year one. Staff has calculated federal tax credits based on 9.0% of the qualified basis, or, in the case of acquisition credit or credit combined with federal subsidies, 3.23%. Applicants are cautioned to consider the expected federal rate when negotiating with investors. TCAC's financial evaluation at project completion will determine the final allocation.

**Special Issues/Other Significant Information:**

This project has received a waiver of the Large Family housing type requirement that requires least twenty-five percent (25%) of the Tax Credit units in the project shall be three bedroom or larger units. This project has 23% 3-bedroom tax-credit units (17 units).

**Legal Status**

Staff has reviewed the Applicant's responses to the questions contained in the Legal Status portion of the Application. No information was disclosed that raised any question regarding the financial viability or legal integrity of the applicant.

**Local Reviewing Agency**

The Local Reviewing Agency, The City of Fresno, has completed a site review of this project and strongly supports this project.

**Recommendation**

Staff recommends that the Committee make a preliminary reservation of tax credits in the following amount(s) contingent upon standard conditions and any additional conditions imposed by the Committee:

<b>Federal Tax Credits/Annual</b>	<b>State Tax Credits/Total</b>
<b>\$803,185</b>	<b>\$0</b>

**Standard Conditions**

The applicant must submit all documentation required for a Carryover Allocation and any Readiness to Proceed Requirements elected. Failure to provide the documentation at the time required may result in rescission of the Credit reservation and cancellation of a carryover allocation.

TCAC makes the preliminary reservation only for the project specified above in the form presented, and involving the parties referred to in the application. No changes in the development team or the project as presented will be permitted without the express approval of TCAC.

The applicant must pay TCAC a performance deposit and allocation fee calculated in accordance with regulation. Additionally, TCAC requires the project owner to pay a monitoring fee before issuance of tax forms.

As project costs are preliminary estimates only, staff recommends that a reservation be made in the amount of federal credit and state credit shown above on condition that the final project costs be supported by itemized lender approved costs and certified costs after the buildings are placed in service.

All unexpended funds in reserve accounts established for the project must remain with the project to be used for the benefit of the property and/or its residents, except for the portion of any accounts funded with deferred developer fees.

All fees charged to the project must be within TCAC limitations. Fees in excess of these limitations will not be considered when determining the amount of credit when the project is placed-in-service.

The applicant/owner shall be subject to underwriting criteria set forth in Section 10327 of the regulations through the final feasibility analysis performed by TCAC at placed-in-service.

Credit awards are contingent upon applicant's acceptance of any revised total project cost, qualified basis and tax credit amount determined by TCAC in its final feasibility analysis.

The applicant must ensure the project meets all Additional Threshold Requirements of the proposed project. If points were awarded for service amenities, the applicant will be required to provide such amenity or amenities identified in the application, for a minimum period of fifteen years and at no cost to the tenants. Applicants that received points for sustainable building methods (energy efficiency) must submit the certification required by Section 10325(c)(6) at project completion. Applicants that received increases (exceptions to limits) in the threshold basis limit under Section 10327(c)(5) must submit the certification required by Section 10322(i)(2) at project completion.

**Additional Conditions:** None.

<b>Points System</b>	<b>Max. Possible Points</b>	<b>Requested Points</b>	<b>Points Awarded</b>
<b>Cost Efficiency / Credit Reduction / Public Funds</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>20</b>
Cost Efficiency	20	2	2
Public Funds	20	18	18
<b>Owner / Management Characteristics</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>
General Partner Experience	6	6	6
Management Experience	3	3	3
<b>Housing Needs</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>Site Amenities</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>15</b>
Within 1/8 mile of transit (van or dial-a-ride service for rural set-aside)	4	4	4
Within 1/2 mile of public park or community center open to general public	3	3	3
Within 1 mile of public library	2	2	2
Within 1 mile of a full-scale grocery/supermarket of at least 25,000 sf	4	4	4
Within 1 mile of a public High School within attendance boundary	3	3	3
Within 1/2 mile of a pharmacy	2	2	2
<b>Service Amenities</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>
LARGE FAMILY, SENIOR, AT-RISK HOUSING TYPES			
Service Coordinator, minimum ratio of 1 FTE to 1,000 bedrooms	3	3	3
Adult ed/health & wellness/skill bldg classes, min. 84 hrs/yr instruction	7	7	7
<b>Sustainable Building Methods</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>
REHABILITATION			
Rehabilitate to improve energy efficiency (change in HERS II rating): 20%	5	5	5
<b>Lowest Income</b>	<b>52</b>	<b>52</b>	<b>52</b>
Basic Targeting	50	50	50
Deeper Targeting – at least 10% of units @ 30% AMI or less	2	2	2
<b>Readiness to Proceed</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>Miscellaneous Federal and State Policies</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>2</b>
Smoke Free Residence	2	2	2
<b>Total Points</b>	<b>138</b>	<b>138</b>	<b>138</b>

**Please Note:** If more than the maximum Site Amenity points were requested, not all amenities may have been scored and/or verified.

**DO NOT RELY ON SCORING IN THIS COMPETITIVE CYCLE FOR FUTURE APPLICATIONS. ALL RE-APPLICATIONS ARE REVIEWED WITHOUT RELIANCE ON PAST**