

**CALIFORNIA TAX CREDIT ALLOCATION COMMITTEE**  
**Project Staff Report**  
**2011 Second Round**  
**September 28, 2011**

**Project Number** CA-2011-158

**Project Name** El Norte Apartments  
 Site Address: 141 E. El Norte Parkway  
 Escondido, CA 92025 County: San Diego  
 Census Tract: 201.080

| <b>Tax Credit Amounts</b> | <b>Federal/Annual</b> | <b>State/Total</b> |
|---------------------------|-----------------------|--------------------|
| Requested:                | \$658,287             | \$0                |
| Recommended:              | \$658,287             | \$0                |

**Applicant Information**

Applicant: Community HousingWorks  
 Contact: Anne B. Wilson  
 Address: 4305 University Avenue, #550  
 San Diego, CA 92105  
 Phone: 619-282-6647 Fax: 619-282-4145  
 Email: awilson@chworks.org

General partner(s) or principal owner(s): El Norte Housing Opportunities, LLC  
 General Partner Type: Nonprofit  
 Developer: Community HousingWorks  
 Consultant: CHPC  
 Management Agent: ConAm Management

**Project Information**

Construction Type: New Construction  
 Total # Residential Buildings: 3  
 Total # of Units: 36  
 No. & % of Tax Credit Units: 35 100%  
 Federal Set-Aside Elected: 40%/60%  
 Federal Subsidy: HUD McKinney-Vento (8 Units 22%) / NSP  
 Affordability Breakdown by Units and % (Lowest Income Points):  
 30% AMI: 11 30 %  
 40% AMI: 4 10 %  
 50% AMI: 12 30 %

**Information**

Set-Aside: N/A  
 Housing Type: Large Family  
 Geographic Area: San Diego County  
 TCAC Project Analyst: DC Navarrette

**Unit Mix**

12 1-Bedroom Units  
 12 2-Bedroom Units  
 12 3-Bedroom Units  


---

 36 Total Units

| <u>Unit Type &amp; Number</u> | <u>2011 Rents Targeted<br/>% of Area Median<br/>Income</u> | <u>2011 Rents Actual<br/>% of Area Median<br/>Income</u> | <u>Proposed<br/>Rent<br/>(including<br/>utilities)</u> |
|-------------------------------|--|--|--|
| 7 1 Bedroom                   | 30%  | 25%  | \$380  |
| 2 1 Bedroom                   | 40%  | 40%  | \$610  |
| 3 1 Bedroom                   | 50%  | 50%  | \$764  |
| 1 2 Bedrooms                  | 30%  | 25%  | \$457  |
| 1 2 Bedrooms                  | 30%  | 30%  | \$549  |
| 1 2 Bedrooms                  | 40%  | 40%  | \$734  |
| 8 2 Bedrooms                  | 50%  | 50%  | \$918  |
| 2 3 Bedrooms                  | 30%  | 30%  | \$633  |
| 1 3 Bedrooms                  | 40%  | 40%  | \$846  |
| 1 3 Bedrooms                  | 50%  | 50%  | \$1,059  |
| 8 3 Bedrooms                  | 60%  | 52%  | \$1,118  |
| 1 2 Bedrooms                  | Manager's Unit   | Manager's Unit   | \$1,019  |

**Project Financing**

Estimated Total Project Cost: \$11,143,915  
 Estimated Residential Project Cost: \$11,143,915

**Residential**

Construction Cost Per Square Foot: \$150  
 Per Unit Cost: \$309,553

**Construction Financing**

| <u>Source</u>         | <u>Amount</u> |
|-----------------------|---------------|
| Union Bank            | \$5,481,383   |
| City of Escondido CDC | \$2,900,000   |
| AHP                   | \$350,000     |
| HUD McKinney-Vento    | \$400,000     |
| City of Escondido NSP | \$250,000     |
| Tax Credit Equity     | \$937,965     |

**Permanent Financing**

| <u>Source</u>         | <u>Amount</u>       |
|-----------------------|---------------------|
| Union Bank            | \$1,053,281         |
| City of Escondido CDC | \$2,900,000         |
| AHP                   | \$350,000           |
| HUD McKinney-Vento    | \$400,000           |
| City of Escondido NSP | \$250,000           |
| Tax Credit Equity     | \$6,190,634         |
| <b>TOTAL</b>          | <b>\$11,143,915</b> |

**Determination of Credit Amount(s)**

|  |             |
|--|-------------|
| Requested Eligible Basis:                                  | \$5,626,390 |
| 130% High Cost Adjustment:                                 | Yes         |
| Applicable Fraction:                                       | 100.00%     |
| Qualified Basis:   | \$7,314,307 |
| Applicable Rate:   | 9.00%       |
| Maximum Annual Federal Credit:                             | \$658,287   |
| Approved Developer Fee (in Project Cost & Eligible Basis): | \$1,230,299 |
| Consultant:  | CHPC        |
| Federal Tax Credit Factor:                                 | \$0.94042   |

Per Regulation Section 10322(i)(4)(A), The “as if vacant” land value and the existing improvement value established at application, as well as the eligible basis amount derived from those values, will be used during all subsequent reviews including the placed in service review, for the purpose of determining the final award of Tax Credits.

Per Regulation Section 10327(c)(2)(C), Once established at the initial funded application, the developer fee cannot be increased, but may be decreased, in the event of a modification in basis.

**Eligible Basis and Basis Limit**

|                                       |              |
|---------------------------------------|--------------|
| Requested Unadjusted Eligible Basis:  | \$5,626,390  |
| Actual Eligible Basis:                | \$9,439,725  |
| Unadjusted Threshold Basis Limit:     | \$7,819,752  |
| Total Adjusted Threshold Basis Limit: | \$10,442,008 |

**Adjustments to Basis Limit:**

Required to Pay Prevailing Wages

One or More Energy Efficiency/Resource Conservation/Indoor Air Quality Features:

- Community gardens of at least 60 square feet per unit
- Install bamboo, stained concrete, cork, salvaged or FSC-Certified wood, ceramic tile, or natural linoleum in all common areas

Local Development Impact Fees

**Tie-Breaker Information**

|         |                     |
|---------|---------------------|
| First:  | <b>Large Family</b> |
| Second: | <b>53.021%</b>      |

**Cost Analysis and Line Item Review**

Staff analysis of project costs to determine reasonableness found all fees to be within TCAC’s underwriting guidelines and TCAC limitations. Annual operating expenses exceed the minimum operating expenses established in the Regulations, and the project pro forma shows a positive cash flow from year one. Staff has calculated federal tax credits based on 9.00% of the qualified basis, or, in the case of acquisition credit or credit combined with federal subsidies, 3.40%. Applicants are cautioned to consider the expected federal rate when negotiating with investors. TCAC's financial evaluation at project completion will determine the final allocation.

**Special Issues/Other Significant Information:** Financing consists of \$2,900,000 from the City of Escondido. Of this total \$500,000 is from fiscal year 2010-11 and was committed on August 18, 2010. \$1,900,000 is from fiscal year 2011-12 and was committed on March 16, 2011. The remaining \$500,000 is from fiscal year 2011-12 and was committed on June 22, 2011.

According to the redevelopment agency, the city council has elected to continue redevelopment agency operations. The housing division is also working to determine substitute funds such as HOME or NSP which are currently in the applications funding sources.

**Legal Status:** Staff has reviewed the Applicant's responses to the questions contained in the Legal Status portion of the Application. No information was disclosed that raised any question regarding the financial viability or legal integrity of the applicant.

**Local Reviewing Agency:**

The Local Reviewing Agency, the City of Escondido has completed a site review of this project and strongly supports the project.

**Recommendation:** Staff recommends that the Committee make a preliminary reservation of tax credits in the following amount(s) contingent upon standard conditions and any additional conditions imposed by the Committee:

|                                   |                                |
|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| <b>Federal Tax Credits/Annual</b> | <b>State Tax Credits/Total</b> |
| <b>\$658,287</b>                  | <b>\$0</b>                     |

**Standard Conditions**

The applicant must submit all documentation required for a Carryover Allocation, any Readiness 180-Day Requirements elected, and a Final Reservation. Failure to provide the documentation at the time required may result in rescission of the Credit reservation and cancellation of a carryover allocation.

TCAC makes the preliminary reservation only for the project specified above in the form presented, and involving the parties referred to in the application. No changes in the development team or the project as presented will be permitted without the express approval of TCAC.

The applicant must pay TCAC a performance deposit and allocation fee calculated in accordance with regulation. Additionally, TCAC requires the project owner to pay a monitoring fee before issuance of tax forms.

As project costs are preliminary estimates only, staff recommends that a reservation be made in the amount of federal credit and state credit shown above on condition that the final project costs be supported by itemized lender approved costs and certified costs after the buildings are placed in service.

All unexpended funds in reserve accounts established for the project must remain with the project to be used for the benefit of the property and/or its residents, except for the portion of any accounts funded with deferred developer fees.

All fees charged to the project must be within TCAC limitations. Fees in excess of these limitations will not be considered when determining the amount of credit when the project is placed-in-service.

The applicant/owner shall be subject to underwriting criteria set forth in Section 10327 of the regulations through the final feasibility analysis performed by TCAC at placed-in-service.

Credit awards are contingent upon applicant's acceptance of any revised total project cost, qualified basis and tax credit amount determined by TCAC in its final feasibility analysis.

The applicant must ensure the project meets all Additional Threshold Requirements of the proposed project. If points were awarded for service amenities, the applicant will be required to provide such amenity or amenities identified in the application, for a minimum period of ten years and at no cost to the tenants. Applicants that received points for sustainable building methods (energy efficiency) must submit the certification required by Section 10325(c)(6) at project completion. Applicants that received increases (exceptions to limits) in the threshold basis limit under Section 10327(c)(5) must submit the certification required by Section 10322(i)(2) at project completion.

**Additional Conditions:** None

| <b>Points System</b>   | <b>Max. Possible Points</b> | <b>Requested Points</b> | <b>Points Awarded</b> |
|--|-----------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|
| <b>Cost Efficiency / Credit Reduction / Public Funds</b>                   | <b>20</b>                   | <b>20</b>               | <b>20</b>             |
| Public Funds   | 20                          | 20                      | 20                    |
| <b>Owner / Management Characteristics</b>                                  | <b>9</b>                    | <b>9</b>                | <b>9</b>              |
| General Partner Experience   | 6                           | 6                       | 6                     |
| Management Experience  | 3                           | 3                       | 3                     |
| <b>Housing Needs</b>   | <b>10</b>                   | <b>10</b>               | <b>10</b>             |
| <b>Site Amenities</b>  | <b>15</b>                   | <b>15</b>               | <b>15</b>             |
| Within ¼ mile of transit stop, service every 30 minutes in rush hours      | 6                           | 6                       | 6                     |
| Within ½ mile of a full-scale grocery/supermarket of at least 25,000 sf    | 4                           | 4                       | 4                     |
| Large Family proj. w/i ½ mile of public school project children may attend | 2                           | 2                       | 2                     |
| Within 1 mile of medical clinic or hospital                                | 2                           | 2                       | 2                     |
| Within ½ mile of a pharmacy  | 1                           | 1                       | 1                     |
| In-unit high speed internet service  | 2                           | 2                       | 2                     |
| <b>Service Amenities</b>   | <b>10</b>                   | <b>10</b>               | <b>10</b>             |
| LARGE FAMILY, SENIOR, AT-RISK HOUSING TYPES                                |                             |                         |                       |
| Service Coordinator, minimum ratio of 1 FTE to 600 bedrooms                | 5                           | 5                       | 5                     |
| After school program for school age children, minimum of 10 hours/week     | 5                           | 5                       | 5                     |
| <b>Sustainable Building Methods</b>  | <b>10</b>                   | <b>10</b>               | <b>10</b>             |
| NEW CONSTRUCTION/ADAPTIVE REUSE  |                             |                         |                       |
| Develop project in accordance w/ requirements of: GreenPoint Rated         | 5                           | 5                       | 5                     |
| Energy efficiency beyond CA Building Code Title 24 requirements: 18%       | 2                           | 2                       | 2                     |
| Develop project to requirements of: GreenPoint Rated Multifamily 100       | 3                           | 3                       | 3                     |
| <b>Lowest Income</b>   | <b>52</b>                   | <b>52</b>               | <b>52</b>             |
| Basic Targeting  | 50                          | 50                      | 50                    |
| Deeper Targeting – at least 10% of units @ 30% AMI or less                 | 2                           | 2                       | 2                     |
| <b>Readiness to Proceed</b>  | <b>20</b>                   | <b>20</b>               | <b>20</b>             |
| <b>Miscellaneous Federal and State Policies</b>                            | <b>2</b>                    | <b>2</b>                | <b>2</b>              |
| State Credit Substitution  | 2                           | 2                       | 2                     |
| <b>Total Points</b>  | <b>148</b>                  | <b>148</b>              | <b>148</b>            |

**Please Note: If more than the maximum Site Amenity points were requested, not all amenities may have been scored and/or verified.**

**DO NOT RELY ON SCORING IN THIS COMPETITIVE CYCLE FOR FUTURE APPLICATIONS. ALL RE-APPLICATIONS ARE REVIEWED WITHOUT RELIANCE ON PAST SCORING.**