

CALIFORNIA TAX CREDIT ALLOCATION COMMITTEE

Project Staff Report

2018 Second Round

September 19, 2018

Warm Springs TOD Village Affordable #2, located at 44960 Warm Springs Boulevard in Fremont, requested and is being recommended for a reservation of \$2,500,000 in annual federal tax credits to finance the new construction of 60 units of housing serving large families with rents affordable to households earning 30%-60% of area median income (AMI). The project will be developed by Eden Housing, Inc. and will be located in Senate District 10 and Assembly District 25.

Project Number CA-18-133

Project Name Warm Springs TOD Village Affordable #2
Site Address: 44960 Warm Springs Boulevard
Fremont, CA 94539 County: Alameda
Census Tract: 4415.030

Tax Credit Amounts	Federal/Annual	State/Total
Requested:	\$2,500,000	\$0
Recommended:	\$2,500,000	\$0

Applicant Information

Applicant: Eden Housing, Inc.
Contact: Linda Mandolini
Address: 22645 Grand Street
Hayward, CA 94541
Phone: 510.542.1460
Email: lmandolini@edenhousing.org

General Partner(s) / Principal Owner(s): Eden Investments, Inc.
General Partner Type: Nonprofit
Parent Company(ies): Eden Housing, Inc.
Developer: Eden Housing, Inc
Investor/Consultant: Community Economics
Management Agent(s): Eden Housing Management, Inc.

Project Information

Construction Type: New Construction
Total # Residential Buildings: 1
Total # of Units: 61
No. & % of Tax Credit Units: 60 100%
Federal Set-Aside Elected: 40%/60%
Federal Subsidy: N/A

Information

Set-Aside: N/A
 Housing Type: Large Family
 Geographic Area: East Bay Region
 TCAC Project Analyst: Carmen Doonan

55-Year Use / Affordability

Aggregate Targeting	Number of Units	Percentage of Affordable Units
At or Below 30% AMI:	12	20%
At or Below 50% AMI:	24	40%
At or Below 60% AMI:	24	40%

Unit Mix

12 1-Bedroom Units
33 2-Bedroom Units
16 3-Bedroom Units
61 Total Units

Unit Type & Number	2018 Rents Targeted % of Area Median Income	2018 Rents Actual % of Area Median Income	Proposed Rent (including utilities)
2 1 Bedroom	30%	30%	\$654
6 1 Bedroom	50%	50%	\$1,090
4 1 Bedroom	60%	60%	\$1,308
8 2 Bedrooms	30%	30%	\$784
12 2 Bedrooms	50%	50%	\$1,307
12 2 Bedrooms	60%	60%	\$1,569
2 3 Bedrooms	30%	30%	\$906
6 3 Bedrooms	50%	50%	\$1,510
8 3 Bedrooms	60%	60%	\$1,812
1 2 Bedrooms	Manager's Unit	Manager's Unit	\$0

TCAC-confirmed Projected Lifetime Rent Benefit: \$49,696,680

Project Cost Summary at Application

Land and Acquisition	\$6,552,442
Construction Costs	\$22,571,705
Rehabilitation Costs	\$0
Construction Contingency	\$1,044,352
Relocation	\$0
Architectural/Engineering	\$1,057,893
Const. Interest, Perm. Financing	\$2,194,429
Legal Fees, Appraisals	\$119,796
Reserves	\$270,054
Other Costs	\$4,047,999
Developer Fee	\$2,000,000
Commercial Costs	\$2,924,493
Total	\$42,783,163

Residential

Construction Cost Per Square Foot:	\$292
Per Unit Cost:	\$650,847
True Cash Per Unit Cost*:	\$536,296

Construction Financing

Source	Amount
Wells Fargo	\$25,181,946
Land Donation	\$6,930,000
Master Developer Loan	\$6,783,063
General Partner Equity	\$100
Tax Credit Equity	\$2,400,000

Permanent Financing

Source	Amount
CCRC	\$4,572,000
Land Donation	\$6,930,000
Master Developer Loan	\$6,783,063
Deferred Developer Fee	\$600,000
General Partner Equity	\$100
Tax Credit Equity	\$23,898,000
TOTAL	\$42,783,163

*Less Donated Land, Fee Waivers, Seller Carryback Loans, and Deferred Developer Fee

Determination of Credit Amount(s)

Requested Eligible Basis:	\$21,367,521
130% High Cost Adjustment:	Yes
Applicable Fraction:	100.00%
Qualified Basis:	\$27,777,777
Applicable Rate:	9.00%
Total Maximum Annual Federal Credit:	\$2,500,000
Approved Developer Fee in Project Cost:	\$2,000,000
Approved Developer Fee in Eligible Basis:	\$1,400,000
Investor/Consultant:	Community Economics
Federal Tax Credit Factor:	\$0.95592

The “as if vacant” land value and the existing improvement value established at application, as well as the eligible basis amount derived from those values, shall not increase during all subsequent reviews including the placed in service review, for the purpose of determining the final award of Tax Credits, unless a waiver has been granted for a purchase price not to exceed the sum of third party debt that will be assumed or paid off. The sum of the third party debt encumbering the property may increase during subsequent reviews to reflect the actual amount.

Eligible Basis and Basis Limit

Requested Unadjusted Eligible Basis:	\$21,367,521
Actual Eligible Basis:	\$31,487,171
Unadjusted Threshold Basis Limit:	\$22,022,204
Total Adjusted Threshold Basis Limit:	\$29,524,839

Adjustments to Basis Limit

- Parking Beneath Residential Units or On-Site Parking Structure of Two or More Levels
- Local Development Impact Fees
- 95% of Upper Floor Units are Elevator-Serviced
- Highest or High Resource Opportunity Area

Tie-Breaker Information

First:	Large Family
Final:	77.424%

Cost Analysis and Line Item Review

Staff analysis of project costs to determine reasonableness found all fees to be within TCAC’s underwriting guidelines and TCAC limitations. Annual operating expenses exceed the minimum operating expenses established in the Regulations, and the project pro forma shows a positive cash flow from year one. Staff has calculated federal tax credits based on 9.0% of the qualified basis, or, in the case of acquisition credit or credit combined with federal subsidies, 3.25%. Applicants are cautioned to consider the expected federal rate when negotiating with investors. TCAC's financial evaluation at project completion will determine the final allocation.

Significant Information / Additional Conditions:

Staff noted the per unit development cost of \$536,269. The applicant noted that the cost is attributed to high land costs in this region, competitive construction market, and high rise design.

This 132 unit application was submitted as a hybrid application serving large families. The project is comprised of a 9% component (CA-18-133) consisting of 61 units and a 4% component (CA-18-613) consisting of 71 units. All units in the project will have access to a community room, computer room, service coordinator, and adult education, health and wellness classes.

Resyndication and Resyndication Transfer Event: None.

Legal Status

Staff has reviewed the Applicant's responses to the questions contained in the Legal Status portion of the Application. No information was disclosed that raised any question regarding the financial viability or legal integrity of the applicant.

Local Reviewing Agency

The Local Reviewing Agency, City of Fremont, has completed a site review of this project and strongly supports this project.

Standard Conditions

The applicant must submit all documentation required for a Carryover Allocation and any Readiness to Proceed Requirements elected. Failure to provide the documentation at the time required may result in rescission of the Credit reservation and cancellation of a carryover allocation.

TCAC makes the preliminary reservation only for the project specified above in the form presented, and involving the parties referred to in the application. No changes in the development team or the project as presented will be permitted without the express approval of TCAC.

The applicant must pay TCAC a performance deposit and allocation fee calculated in accordance with regulation. Additionally, TCAC requires the project owner to pay a monitoring fee before issuance of tax forms.

As project costs are preliminary estimates only, staff recommends that a reservation be made in the amount of federal credit and state credit shown above on condition that the final project costs be supported by itemized lender approved costs and certified costs after the buildings are placed in service.

All unexpended funds in reserve accounts established for the project must remain with the project to be used for the benefit of the property and/or its residents, except for the portion of any accounts funded with deferred developer fees.

All fees charged to the project must be within TCAC limitations. Fees in excess of these limitations will not be considered when determining the amount of credit when the project is placed-in-service.

The applicant/owner shall be subject to underwriting criteria set forth in Section 10327 of the regulations through the final feasibility analysis performed by TCAC at placed-in-service.

Credit awards are contingent upon applicant's acceptance of any revised total project cost, qualified basis and tax credit amount determined by TCAC in its final feasibility analysis.

The applicant must ensure the project meets all Additional Threshold Requirements of the proposed project. If points were awarded for service amenities, the applicant will be required to provide such amenity or amenities identified in the application, for a minimum period of fifteen years and at no cost to the tenants. Applicants that received points for sustainable building methods (energy efficiency) must submit the certification required by Section 10325(c)(5) at project completion. Applicants that received increases (exceptions to limits) in the threshold basis limit under Section 10327(c)(5) must submit the certification required by Section 10322(i)(2) at project completion.

Points System	Max. Possible Points	Requested Points	Points Awarded
Owner / Management Characteristics	9	9	9
General Partner Experience	6	6	6
Management Experience	3	3	3
Housing Needs	10	10	10
Site Amenities	15	15	15
Within ½ mile of transit, service every 30 min, 25 units/acre density	7	7	7
Within ½ mile of public park or community center open to general public	3	3	3
Within 1.5 miles of a full-scale grocery/supermarket of at least 25,000 sf	3	3	3
Within ¾ mile of a public elementary school	2	2	2
Within 1 mile of medical clinic or hospital	2	2	0
Within ½ mile of a pharmacy	2	2	2
Service Amenities	10	10	10
LARGE FAMILY, SENIOR, AT-RISK HOUSING TYPES			
Service Coordinator, minimum ratio of 1 FTE to 600 bedrooms	5	5	5
Adult ed/health & wellness/skill bldg classes, min. 60 hrs/yr instruction	5	5	5
Sustainable Building Methods	5	5	5
NEW CONSTRUCTION/ADAPTIVE REUSE			
Develop project in accordance w/ requirements: GreenPoint Rated Program	5	5	5
Lowest Income	52	52	52
Basic Targeting	50	50	50
Deeper Targeting – at least 10% of Low Income Units @ 30% AMI or less	2	2	2
Readiness to Proceed	10	10	10
Miscellaneous Federal and State Policies	2	2	2
State Credit Substitution	2	2	2
Total Points	113	113	113

Please Note: If more than the maximum Site Amenity points were requested, not all amenities may have been scored and/or verified.

DO NOT RELY ON SCORING IN THIS COMPETITIVE CYCLE FOR FUTURE APPLICATIONS. ALL RE-APPLICATIONS ARE REVIEWED WITHOUT RELIANCE ON PAST SCORING.