

CALIFORNIA TAX CREDIT ALLOCATION COMMITTEE

Project Staff Report

2019 Second Round

September 25, 2019

REVISED

Trinity Place Apartments, located at 4445 Glacier Ave. in San Diego, requested and is being recommended for a reservation of \$2,010,683 in annual federal tax credits to finance the new construction of 73 units of housing serving special needs tenants with rents affordable to households earning 30% of area median income (AMI). The project will be developed by Wakeland Housing and Development Corporation and will be located in Senate District 39 and Assembly District 79.

The project will be receiving rental assistance in the form of HUD Section 8 Project-based Vouchers. The project financing includes state funding from SNHP through CalHFA.

| | |
|-----------------------|--------------------------|
| Project Number | CA-19-104 |
| Project Name | Trinity Place Apartments |
| Site Address: | 4445 Glacier Ave. |
| | San Diego, CA 92120 |
| | County: San Diego |
| Census Tract: | 96.030 |

| Tax Credit Amounts | Federal/Annual | State/Total |
|--|-----------------------|--------------------|
| Requested: | \$2,010,683 | \$0 |
| Recommended only if the Committee approves the pending appeal: | \$2,010,683 | \$0 |

Applicant Information

| | |
|------------|---------------------------------|
| Applicant: | Wakeland Trinity Place LP |
| Contact: | Kenneth L. Sauder |
| Address: | 1230 Columbia Street, Suite 950 |
| | San Diego, CA 92101 |
| Phone: | 619 677 2320 |
| Email: | ksauder@wakelandhdc.com |

| | |
|--|--|
| General Partner(s) / Principal Owner(s): | Wakeland Trinity Place LLC |
| General Partner Type: | Nonprofit |
| Parent Company(ies): | Wakeland Housing and Development Corp. |
| Developer: | Wakeland Housing and Development Corp. |
| Investor/Consultant: | California Housing Partnership Corporation |
| Management Agent(s): | ConAm Management Corporation |

Project Information

Construction Type: New Construction
 Total # Residential Buildings: 1
 Total # of Units: 74
 No. & % of Tax Credit Units: 73 100%
 Federal Set-Aside Elected: 40%/60%
 Federal Subsidy: HOME / HUD Section 8 Project-based Vouchers (73 units - 100%)

Information

Set-Aside: Special Needs
 Housing Type: Special Needs
 Type of Special Needs: Homeless/formerly homeless
 Average Targeted Affordability of Special Needs/SRO Project Units: 30.00%
 % of Special Need Units: 73 units 100%
 Geographic Area: San Diego County
 TCAC Project Analyst: Diane SooHoo

55-Year Use / Affordability

| Aggregate Targeting Number of Units | Percentage of Affordable Units |
|--|---|
| At or Below 30% AMI: 58 | 80% |

Unit Mix

| |
|-----------------------|
| 73 SRO/Studio Units |
| 1 2-Bedroom Units |
| 74 Total Units |

| Unit Type & Number | 2019 Rents Targeted % of Area Median Income | 2019 Rents Actual % of Area Median Income | Proposed Rent (including utilities) |
|-------------------------------|--|--|--|
| 73 SRO/Studio | 30% | 30% | \$561 |
| 1 2 Bedrooms | Manager's Unit | Manager's Unit | \$0 |

Project Cost Summary at Application

| | |
|----------------------------------|---------------------|
| Land and Acquisition | \$5,072,816 |
| Construction Costs | \$18,012,315 |
| Rehabilitation Costs | \$0 |
| Construction Contingency | \$1,155,616 |
| Relocation | \$0 |
| Architectural/Engineering | \$975,000 |
| Const. Interest, Perm. Financing | \$1,962,599 |
| Legal Fees | \$30,000 |
| Reserves | \$242,345 |
| Other Costs | \$3,141,535 |
| Developer Fee | \$1,400,000 |
| Commercial Costs | \$0 |
| Total | \$31,992,225 |

Residential

| | |
|------------------------------------|-----------|
| Construction Cost Per Square Foot: | \$346 |
| Per Unit Cost: | \$432,327 |
| True Cash Per Unit Cost*: | \$430,045 |

Construction Financing

| Source | Amount |
|-------------------------------|--------------|
| Wells Fargo | \$21,414,802 |
| CalHFA - SNHP ¹ | \$2,725,632 |
| Accrued/Deferred Interest | \$97,453 |
| SDHC ² - HOME | \$500,000 |
| Accrued/Deferred Interest | \$17,878 |
| Civic San Diego Loan | \$4,000,000 |
| Accrued/Deferred Interest | \$143,017 |
| RTCIP ³ Fee Waiver | \$168,922 |
| Deferred Costs | \$1,029,039 |
| Tax Credit Equity | \$1,895,482 |

Permanent Financing

| Source | Amount |
|-------------------------------|---------------------|
| CCRC | \$3,349,500 |
| CalHFA - SNHP ¹ | \$2,725,632 |
| Accrued/Deferred Interest | \$97,453 |
| SDHC ² - HOME | \$700,000 |
| Accrued/Deferred Interest | \$17,878 |
| Civic San Diego Loan | \$4,800,000 |
| Accrued/Deferred Interest | \$143,017 |
| RTCIP ³ Fee Waiver | \$168,922 |
| Tax Credit Equity | \$19,989,823 |
| TOTAL | \$31,992,225 |

*Less Donated Land, Fee Waivers, Seller Carryback Loans, and Deferred Developer Fee

¹Special Needs Housing Program

²San Diego Housing Commission

³Regional Transportation Congestion Improvement Program

Determination of Credit Amount(s)

| | |
|--|--|
| Requested Eligible Basis: | \$17,185,328 |
| 130% High Cost Adjustment: | Yes |
| Applicable Fraction: | 100.00% |
| Qualified Basis: | \$22,340,926 |
| Applicable Rate: | 9.00% |
| Total Maximum Annual Federal Credit: | \$2,010,683 |
| Approved Developer Fee (in Project Cost & Eligible Basis): | \$1,400,000 |
| Investor/Consultant: | California Housing Partnership Corporation |
| Federal Tax Credit Factor: | \$0.99418 |

The “as if vacant” land value and the existing improvement value established at application, as well as the eligible basis amount derived from those values, shall not increase during all subsequent reviews including the placed in service review, for the purpose of determining the final award of Tax Credits, unless a waiver has been granted for a purchase price not to exceed the sum of third party debt that will be assumed or paid off. The sum of the third party debt encumbering the property may increase during subsequent reviews to reflect the actual amount.

Eligible Basis and Basis Limit

| | |
|---------------------------------------|--------------|
| Requested Unadjusted Eligible Basis: | \$17,185,328 |
| Actual Eligible Basis: | \$25,681,653 |
| Unadjusted Threshold Basis Limit: | \$15,447,031 |
| Total Adjusted Threshold Basis Limit: | \$24,588,426 |

Adjustments to Basis Limit

Required to Pay State or Federal Prevailing Wages/Financed by labor-affiliated organization employing construction workers paid at least state or federal prevailing wages

Parking Beneath Residential Units or On-Site Parking Structure of Two or More Levels

100% of the Low Income Units for Special Needs Population

One or More Energy Efficiency/Resource Conservation/Indoor Air Quality Features:

- Project has onsite renewable generation estimated to produce 50% or more of annual tenant electricity use as indicated in TCAC Regulations.
- Install bamboo, stained concrete, cork, salvaged or FSC-Certified wood, natural linoleum, natural rubber, or ceramic tile in all kitchens, living rooms, and bathrooms (where no VOC adhesives or backing is used)
- Install bamboo, stained concrete, cork, salvaged or FSC-Certified wood, natural linoleum, natural rubber, or ceramic tile in all interior floor space other than units (where no VOC adhesives or backing is also used)
- For new construction projects, meet all requirements of US EPA Indoor Air Plus Program.

Environmental Mitigation

Local Development Impact Fees

95% of Upper Floor Units are Elevator-Serviced

Tie-Breaker Information

| | |
|--------|----------------------|
| First: | Special Needs |
| Final: | 61.052% |

Cost Analysis and Line Item Review

Staff analysis of project costs to determine reasonableness found all fees to be within TCAC's underwriting guidelines and TCAC limitations. Annual operating expenses meet or exceed the minimum operating expenses established in the Regulations, and the project pro forma shows a positive cash flow from year one. Staff has calculated federal tax credits based on 9.0% of the qualified basis, or, in the case of acquisition credit or credit combined with federal subsidies, 3.30%. Applicants are cautioned to consider the expected federal rate when negotiating with investors. TCAC's financial evaluation at project completion will determine the final allocation.

Significant Information / Additional Conditions

TCAC staff initially reduced points for general partner experience because the documentation was not included in the application. At the September 25, 2019 Committee Meeting, the Committee granted the applicant's appeal of staff's point reduction.

The applicant omitted off-site costs of \$50,000 in the application development budget. Pursuant to TCAC Regulations 10327(a), the shortage of sources for off-site costs is within the \$50,000 limit allowed by TCAC to be deemed an application error which shall be covered by the project's contingency line item. The applicant must fix this error in the readiness submission.

The proposed rents do not include any utility allowance. The owner will pay for all utilities.

Resyndication and Resyndication Transfer Event: None**Legal Status**

Staff has reviewed the Applicant's responses to the questions contained in the Legal Status portion of the Application. No information was disclosed that raised any question regarding the financial viability or legal integrity of the applicant.

Local Reviewing Agency

The Local Reviewing Agency, San Diego Housing Commission, has completed a site review of this project and strongly supports this project.

Standard Conditions

The applicant must submit all documentation required for a Carryover Allocation and any Readiness to Proceed Requirements elected. Failure to provide the documentation at the time required may result in rescission of the Credit reservation and cancellation of a carryover allocation.

TCAC makes the preliminary reservation only for the project specified above in the form presented, and involving the parties referred to in the application. No changes in the development team or the project as presented will be permitted without the express approval of TCAC.

The applicant must pay TCAC a performance deposit and allocation fee calculated in accordance with regulation. Additionally, TCAC requires the project owner to pay a monitoring fee before issuance of tax forms.

As project costs are preliminary estimates only, staff recommends that a reservation be made in the amount of federal credit and state credit shown above on condition that the final project costs be supported by itemized lender approved costs and certified costs after the buildings are placed in service.

All unexpended funds in reserve accounts established for the project must remain with the project to be used for the benefit of the property and/or its residents, except for the portion of any accounts funded with deferred developer fees.

All fees charged to the project must be within TCAC limitations. Fees in excess of these limitations will not be considered when determining the amount of credit when the project is placed-in-service.

The applicant/owner shall be subject to underwriting criteria set forth in Section 10327 of the regulations through the final feasibility analysis performed by TCAC at placed-in-service.

Credit awards are contingent upon applicant's acceptance of any revised total project cost, qualified basis and tax credit amount determined by TCAC in its final feasibility analysis.

The applicant must ensure the project meets all Additional Threshold Requirements of the proposed project. If points were awarded for service amenities, the applicant will be required to provide such amenity or amenities identified in the application, for a minimum period of fifteen years and at no cost to the tenants. Applicants that received points for sustainable building methods (energy efficiency) must submit the certification required by Section 10325(c)(5) at project completion. Applicants that received increases (exceptions to limits) in the threshold basis limit under Section 10327(c)(5) must submit the certification required by Section 10322(i)(2) at project completion.

| Points System | Max. Possible Points | Requested Points | Points Awarded |
|---|-----------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|
| Owner / Management Characteristics | 9 | 9 | 3 |
| General Partner Experience | 6 | 6 | 0 |
| Management Experience | 3 | 3 | 3 |
| Housing Needs | 10 | 10 | 10 |
| Site Amenities | 15 | 15 | 15 |
| Within ¼ mile of transit, service every 30 min, 25 units/acre density | 7 | 7 | 7 |
| Within ½ mile of public park or community center open to general public | 3 | 3 | 3 |
| Within ½ mile of a full-scale grocery/supermarket of at least 25,000 sf | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| Within ½ mile of medical clinic or hospital | 3 | 3 | 3 |
| Within ½ mile of a pharmacy | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| Service Amenities | 10 | 10 | 10 |
| SPECIAL NEEDS HOUSING TYPE | | | |
| Case Manager, minimum ratio of 1 FTE to 100 bedrooms | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| Adult ed/health & wellness/skill bldg classes, min. 84 hrs/yr instruction | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| Sustainable Building Methods | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| NEW CONSTRUCTION/ADAPTIVE REUSE | | | |
| Develop project in accordance w/ requirements: GreenPoint Rated Program | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| Lowest Income | 52 | 52 | 52 |
| Basic Targeting | 50 | 50 | 50 |
| Deeper Targeting – at least 10% of Low Income Units @ 30% AMI or less | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| Readiness to Proceed | 10 | 10 | 10 |
| Miscellaneous Federal and State Policies | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| State Credit Substitution | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| Total Points | 113 | 113 | 107 |

Please Note: If more than the maximum Site Amenity points were requested, not all amenities may have been scored and/or verified.

**DO NOT RELY ON SCORING IN THIS COMPETITIVE CYCLE FOR FUTURE APPLICATIONS.
ALL RE-APPLICATIONS ARE REVIEWED WITHOUT RELIANCE ON PAST SCORING.**