CALIFORNIA TAX CREDIT ALLOCATION COMMITTEE

Project Staff Report 2008 Second Round Cycle **October 8, 2008**

Project Number CA-2008-103

Project Name Carson City Center Senior Housing

Site Address: 708-724 East Carson Street & 21720 Avalon Boulevard

> Carson, CA 90745 County: Los Angeles

Census Tracts: 5439.03

Applicant Information

Applicant: Thomas L. Safran d.b.a. Thomas Safran & Associates

Contact: Andrew Gross

Address: 11812 San Vicente Boulevard, Suite 600

Los Angeles, CA 90049

(310) 820-4888 Phone: Fax: (310) 207-5063

Andrew@tsahousing.com Email:

General Partners Type: Joint Venture

Information

Set-Aside: N/A Housing Type: Seniors Geographic Area: Los Angeles

Eligible Basis

Requested: \$11,778,849 Actual: \$18,049,960 Maximum Permitted: \$15,380,536

Adjustments to Threshold Basis Limit: Parking Beneath Residential Units

3 or More Energy Efficiency/Resource Conservation/Indoor Air Quality Features Environmental Mitigation 95% of Upper Floor Units are Elevator-Serviced

Local Development Impact Fees

Tax Credit Amounts	Federal/Annual	State/Total
Requested:	\$1,200,500	\$0
Recommended:	\$1,200,500	\$0

Project Information

Construction Type: **New Construction**

Federal Subsidy: None Total # of Units: 86 Total # Residential Buildings: 1

Income/Rent Targeting

Federal Set-Aside Elected: 40%/60%

% & No. of Tax Credit Units: 100% - 85 units

Breakdown by %: 10% @ 30%, 10% @ 40%, 50% @ 50% Project Number: CA-2008-103

October 8, 2008

Selection Criteria	Max. Possible Points	Requested Points	Points Awarded
Cost Efficiency/Credit Reduction/Public Funds Maximum of 20 points	20	20	20
☐ Credit Reduction	20	2	2
□ Public Funds	18	18	18
Owner / Management Characteristics Maximum of 9 points	9	9	9
General Partner Experience	6	6	6
Management Experience	3	3	3
Negative Points			
Housing Needs Maximum of 10 points	10	10	10
Site Amenities Maximum of 15 points	15	15	15
Within ¼ mile of transit stop with service every 30 minutes & 25 units per acre density	7	7	7
Within ½ mile of public park or community center open to general public	2	2	2
Within ¼ mile of a full-scale grocery store with staples, fresh meat and fresh produce	4	4	4
Senior project within ¼ mile of daily operated senior center or facility for seniors	3	3	3
Within ½ mile of medical clinic or hospital	3	3	3
Within ¼ mile of a pharmacy	2	2	2
Service Amenities Maximum of 10 points	10	10	<i>10</i>
Educational classes (e.g. ESL, Computer training, etc.)	5	5	5
Bona fide service coordinator available	5	5	5
Neighborhood Revitalization Maximum of 9 points	9	9	9
Sustainable Building Methods Maximum of 8 points	8	8	8
New construction/adaptive reuse increases energy efficiency 10% above Title 24	4	4	4
Minimum 1 High Efficiency Toilet (1.3 gpf) or dual flush	2	2	2
Rainwater retention at ½ inch rainfall per 24-hour period	1	1	1
Project has nonsmoking buildings or contiguous sections within a building	1	1	1
Lowest Income Maximum of 52 points	52	52	<u>52</u>
Basic Targeting	50	50	50
Deeper Targeting – at least 10% of units @ 30% AMI or less	2	2	2
Readiness to Proceed Maximum of 20 points	20	20	20
State credit substitution Maximum of 2 points		2	2
Total Points	155	155	155

Tie-Breaker Information

Tie-Breaker Categories Apply to this Project: Yes

First: Housing Type **Senior**

Second: Maximum Neighborhood Revitalization Points/Federal Designated Area Yes

Third: Calculated Ratio per Regulation 10325(c)(12) **52.660%**

2008 Rents for 2nd Round 2008

<u>Unit Type & Number</u>		% of Area Median Income	Proposed Rent	
			(including utilities)	
9	One-bedroom Units	30%	\$426	
9	One-bedroom Units	40%	\$568	
43	One-bedroom Units	50%	\$710	
24	One-bedroom Units	60%	\$852	
1	Two-bedroom Unit	Managers' Units	\$1,023	

Project Number: CA-2008-103 Page 3

October 8, 2008

The general partners or principal owners are Thomas Safran and Housing Corporation of America.

The project developer is Thomas Safran & Associates.

The management agent is Thomas Safran & Associates.

The market analyst is Prior & Associates.

The Local Reviewing Agency, the city of Carson, has completed as site review of this project and strongly supports this project.

Project Financing

Estimated Total Project Cost: \$27,881,412 Per Unit Cost: \$324,202 Construction Cost Per Sq. Foot: \$292

Construction Financing

Permanent Financing

Source	Amount	Source	Amount
Washington Mutual	\$16,081,412	Washington Mutual	\$4,676,660
City of Carson	\$9,800,000	City of Carson	\$9,800,000
FHLB – AHP	\$1,000,000	FHLB – AHP	\$1,000,000
Deferred Developer Fee	\$1,000,000	Deferred Developer Fee	\$1,000,000
-		Investor Equity	\$11,404,752
		TOTAL	\$27,881,412

Determination of Credit Amount(s)

\$11,778,849
Yes
100%
\$306,250
\$15,006,254
8.00%
\$1,200,500
\$0
\$2,000,000
\$1,400,000
\$0.95

Applicant requests and staff recommends annual federal credits of \$1,200,500, based on a qualified basis of \$15,006,254 and a funding shortfall of \$11,404,572.

Cost Analysis and Line Item Review

The requested eligible basis \$11,778,849 is below TCAC's threshold basis limit \$15,380,536. The basis limit was increased by the following extraordinary features: projects requiring toxic or other environmental mitigation as certified by the project architect, local development impact fees, projects where 95% of upper floor units are elevator-serviced, projects that are required to provide parking beneath the residential units, and the adjustment for projects with 3 or more energy efficiency/resource conservation/indoor air quality items for using a Minimum Efficiency Report Value (MERV) 8 or higher air filter for HVAC systems that introduce outside air, using CRI Green Label Plus Carpet or no carpet in all bedrooms, and using at least four recycled products listed in the Construction, Flooring, or Recreation section of the California Integrated Waste Management Board's Recycled Content Products Database.

Project Number: CA-2008-103 Page 4

October 8, 2008

Staff analysis of project costs to determine reasonableness found most fees to be within TCAC's underwriting guidelines and TCAC limitations with the exception of the contractor's overhead, profit, and general requirement costs as explained in the Special Issues section of this report.

Annual operating expenses exceed the minimum operating expenses established in the Regulations, and the project pro forma shows a positive cash flow from year one.

Staff has calculated federal tax credits based on 8.00% of the qualified basis. Applicants are cautioned to consider the expected federal rate when negotiating with investors. TCAC's financial evaluation at project completion will determine the final allocation.

Special Issues/Other Significant Information: The applicant's estimate of the contractor's profit, overhead and general requirement costs exceed the limits established by regulation. At final review prior to the issuance of the IRS 8609 tax forms, any costs and basis in excess of the limit will not be allowed.

Legal Status: Staff has reviewed the Applicant's responses to the questions contained in the Legal Status portion of the Application. No information was disclosed that raised any question regarding the financial viability or legal integrity of the applicant.

Recommendation: Staff recommends that the Committee make a preliminary reservation of tax credits, in the following amount(s) contingent upon standard conditions and any additional conditions imposed by the Committee:

Federal/Annual \$1,200,500

State/Total \$0

Standard Conditions

An application for a carryover allocation must be submitted by October 31, 2008, as required by regulation section 10328(d), together with the applicable allocation fee and all required documentation. The time for meeting the "10%" test and submitting related documentation will be no later than six (6) months after the date of the executed carryover allocation (as defined by IRC Section 42 and IRS Notices). The applicant must ensure the project meets all Additional Threshold Requirements for the housing type of the proposed project.

The applicant must submit all documentation required for a Final Reservation no later than February 1 of the year that the building(s) must be placed in service pursuant to Section 42(h)(1)(E)(i) of the Internal Revenue Code of 1986, as amended. The applicant shall provide the Committee a Final Reservation application providing the documentation for the project set forth in Section 10322(i)(1) of these regulations. Failure to provide the documentation at the time required may result in rescission of the Credit reservation and cancellation of a carryover allocation.

TCAC makes the preliminary reservation only for the project specified above in the form presented, and involving the parties referred to in the application. No changes in the development team or the project as presented will be permitted without the express approval of TCAC.

Project Number: CA-2008-103

October 8, 2008

The applicant must pay TCAC a performance deposit and allocation fee calculated in accordance with regulation. The performance deposit must be paid by cashier's check within 20 calendar days of any preliminary reservation. The allocation fee must be paid within a time period specified in the preliminary reservation letter. The allocation fee will be due prior to execution of a carryover allocation or issuance of tax forms, whichever comes first. Additionally, TCAC requires the project owner to pay a monitoring fee before issuance of tax forms.

As project costs are preliminary estimates only, staff recommends that a reservation be made in the amount of federal credit shown above on condition that the final project costs be supported by itemized lender approved costs and certified costs after the buildings are placed in service.

All unexpended funds in reserve accounts established for the project must remain with the project to be used for the benefit of the property and/or its residents, except for the portion of any accounts funded with deferred developer fees.

All fees charged to the project must be within TCAC limitations. Fees in excess of these limitations will not be considered when determining the amount of credit when the project is placed-in-service.

The applicant/owner shall be subject to underwriting criteria set forth in Section 10327 of the regulations through the final feasibility analysis performed by TCAC at placed-in-service.

Credit awards are contingent upon applicant's acceptance of any revised total project cost, qualified basis and tax credit amount determined by TCAC in its final feasibility analysis.

If points were awarded for service amenities, the applicant will be required to provide such amenity or amenities identified in the application, for a minimum period of ten years and at no cost to the tenants.

Applicants that received points for sustainable building methods (energy efficiency) must submit the certification required by Section 10325(c)(8) at project completion.

Applicants that received increases (exceptions to limits) in the threshold basis limit under Section 10327(c)(5) must submit the certification required by Section 10322(i)(2)(P) at project completion.

Additional Conditions

Applicants that received 20 points for readiness to proceed must meet ALL of the following requirements. The applicant must be ready to begin construction within 150 days of the Credit Reservation which is March 9, 2009, as evidenced by submission, within that time of, recorded deeds of trust for all construction financing, payment of all construction lender fees, issuance of building permits and notice to proceed delivered to the contractor. Failure to meet this timeline will result in rescission of the Credit Reservation.

Project Analyst: Jack Waegell