

CALIFORNIA TAX CREDIT ALLOCATION COMMITTEE
Project Staff Report
2013 First Round
June 12, 2013

Project Number CA-13-085

Project Name Third Avenue Apartments
 Site Address: 1534, 1540, 1544 Third Avenue & 2618 Baldwin Lane
 Walnut Creek, CA 94597 County: Contra Costa
 Census Tract: 3400.010

Tax Credit Amounts	Federal/Annual	State/Total
Requested:	\$1,125,707	\$3,752,356
Recommended:	\$1,125,707	\$3,752,356

Applicant Information

Applicant: Satellite Affordable Housing Associates
 Contact: Susan Friedland
 Address: 1521 University Avenue
 Berkeley, CA 94703
 Phone: 510-647-0700 Fax: 510-647-0820
 Email: sfriedland@sahahomes.org

General partner(s) or principal owner(s): Satellite AHA Development Inc.
 General Partner Type: Nonprofit
 Developer: Satellite Affordable Housing Associates
 Investor/Consultant: Community Economics
 Management Agent(s): Satellite AHA Property Management

Project Information

Construction Type: New Construction
 Total # Residential Buildings: 1
 Total # of Units: 48
 No. & % of Tax Credit Units: 47 100%
 Federal Set-Aside Elected: 40%/60%
 Federal Subsidy: HUD Section 8 Project-Based Contract (29 units - 61%)
 HOME / HOPWA

Affordability Breakdown by Units and % (Lowest Income Points):

30% AMI:	13	25 %
45% AMI:	5	10 %
50% AMI:	29	40 %

Information

Set-Aside: N/A
 Housing Type: Large Family
 Geographic Area: North and East Bay Region
 TCAC Project Analyst: Connie Osorio

Unit Mix

20 1-Bedroom Units
 12 2-Bedroom Units
 16 3-Bedroom Units

 48 Total Units

<u>Unit Type & Number</u>	<u>2013 Rents Targeted % of Area Median Income</u>	<u>2013 Rents Actual % of Area Median Income</u>	<u>Proposed Rent (including utilities)</u>
2 1 Bedroom	30%	22%	\$360
1 1 Bedroom	30%	30%	\$502
3 1 Bedroom	30%	15%	\$256
1 1 Bedroom	45%	45%	\$753
2 1 Bedroom	50%	50%	\$836
11 1 Bedroom	50%	50%	\$836
3 2 Bedrooms	30%	30%	\$602
2 2 Bedrooms	30%	18%	\$356
6 2 Bedrooms	50%	50%	\$1,003
2 3 Bedrooms	30%	30%	\$696
4 3 Bedrooms	45%	45%	\$1,044
10 3 Bedrooms	50%	50%	\$1,160
1 2 Bedrooms	Manager's Unit	Manager's Unit	\$0

Project Financing

Estimated Total Project Cost: \$24,296,960
 Estimated Residential Project Cost: \$24,296,960

Construction Financing

<u>Source</u>	<u>Amount</u>
Wells Fargo	\$13,824,491
City of Walnut Creek	\$4,093,500
Contra Costa County HOME	\$2,450,000
Contra Costa County HOPWA	\$250,000
MHSA	\$562,430
State Dept. of Developmental Services	\$400,000
Tax Credit Equity	\$1,410,893

Residential

Construction Cost Per Square Foot: \$254
 Per Unit Cost: \$506,187

Permanent Financing

<u>Source</u>	<u>Amount</u>
Wells Fargo Tranche A	\$190,000
Wells Fargo Tranche B	\$1,772,000
City of Walnut Creek	\$4,093,500
Contra Costa County HOME	\$2,450,000
Contra Costa County HOPWA	\$250,000
MHSA	\$562,430
State Dept. of Developmental Services	\$400,000
AHP	\$470,000
General Partner Equity	\$100
Tax Credit Equity	\$14,108,930
TOTAL	\$24,296,960

Determination of Credit Amount(s)

Requested Eligible Basis:	\$12,507,854
130% High Cost Adjustment:	No
Applicable Fraction:	100.00%
Qualified Basis:	\$12,507,854
Applicable Rate:	9.00%
Applicable Rate:	3.20%
Maximum Annual Federal Credit:	\$1,125,707
Total State Credit:	\$3,752,356
Approved Developer Fee (in Project Cost & Eligible Basis):	\$1,400,000
Investor/Consultant:	Community Economics
Federal Tax Credit Factor:	\$1.02001
State Tax Credit Factor:	\$0.70000

Per Regulation Section 10322(i)(4)(A), The “as if vacant” land value and the existing improvement value established at application, as well as the eligible basis amount derived from those values, will be used during all subsequent reviews including the placed in service review, for the purpose of determining the final award of Tax Credits.

Per Regulation Section 10327(c)(2)(C), Once established at the initial funded application, the developer fee cannot be increased, but may be decreased, in the event of a modification in basis.

Eligible Basis and Basis Limit

Requested Unadjusted Eligible Basis:	\$12,507,854
Actual Eligible Basis:	\$19,769,525
Unadjusted Threshold Basis Limit:	\$12,206,124
Total Adjusted Threshold Basis Limit:	\$16,038,157

Adjustments to Basis Limit:

- Required to Pay Prevailing Wages
- Parking Beneath Residential Units
- Local Development Impact Fees

Tie-Breaker Information

First:	Large Family
Second:	60.873%

Cost Analysis and Line Item Review

Staff analysis of project costs to determine reasonableness found all fees to be within TCAC’s underwriting guidelines and TCAC limitations. Annual operating expenses exceed the minimum operating expenses established in the Regulations, and the project pro forma shows a positive cash flow from year one. Staff has calculated federal tax credits based on 9.00% of the qualified basis, or, in the case of acquisition credit or credit combined with federal subsidies, 3.20%. Applicants are cautioned to consider the expected federal rate when negotiating with investors. TCAC's financial evaluation at project completion will determine the final allocation.

Special Issues/Other Significant Information:

Staff noted a per unit development cost of \$506,187, which is relatively higher than the average in the geographic area. The applicant noted that the high cost per unit is attributed to the City of Walnut Creek’s zoning ordinance which limits the finished height of the building to 30 feet and the City's requirement of 58 parking spaces for 48 units. As a result, the Applicant will build a subterranean parking garage which has a significant impact on the overall project cost.

All units will be individually metered for water as required by East Bay Municipal Utility District (EBMUD) for multi-family properties. Sub-meters will be located within each apartment which will track and bill individual water usage.

Legal Status: Staff has reviewed the Applicant's responses to the questions contained in the Legal Status portion of the Application. No information was disclosed that raised any question regarding the financial viability or legal integrity of the applicant.

Local Reviewing Agency:

The Local Reviewing Agency, City of Walnut Creek, has completed a site review of this project and strongly supports this project.

Recommendation: Staff recommends that the Committee make a preliminary reservation of tax credits in the following amount(s) contingent upon standard conditions and any additional conditions imposed by the Committee:

Federal Tax Credits/Annual	State Tax Credits/Total
\$1,125,707	\$3,752,356

Standard Conditions

The applicant must submit all documentation required for a Carryover Allocation, any Readiness to Proceed Requirements elected, and a Final Reservation. Failure to provide the documentation at the time required may result in rescission of the Credit reservation and cancellation of a carryover allocation.

TCAC makes the preliminary reservation only for the project specified above in the form presented, and involving the parties referred to in the application. No changes in the development team or the project as presented will be permitted without the express approval of TCAC.

The applicant must pay TCAC a performance deposit and allocation fee calculated in accordance with regulation. Additionally, TCAC requires the project owner to pay a monitoring fee before issuance of tax forms.

As project costs are preliminary estimates only, staff recommends that a reservation be made in the amount of federal credit and state credit shown above on condition that the final project costs be supported by itemized lender approved costs and certified costs after the buildings are placed in service.

All unexpended funds in reserve accounts established for the project must remain with the project to be used for the benefit of the property and/or its residents, except for the portion of any accounts funded with deferred developer fees.

All fees charged to the project must be within TCAC limitations. Fees in excess of these limitations will not be considered when determining the amount of credit when the project is placed-in-service.

The applicant/owner shall be subject to underwriting criteria set forth in Section 10327 of the regulations through the final feasibility analysis performed by TCAC at placed-in-service.

Credit awards are contingent upon applicant's acceptance of any revised total project cost, qualified basis and tax credit amount determined by TCAC in its final feasibility analysis.

The applicant must ensure the project meets all Additional Threshold Requirements of the proposed project. If points were awarded for service amenities, the applicant will be required to provide such amenity or amenities identified in the application, for a minimum period of ten years and at no cost to the tenants. Applicants that received points for sustainable building methods (energy efficiency) must submit the certification required by Section 10325(c)(6) at project completion. Applicants that received increases (exceptions to limits) in the threshold basis limit under Section 10327(c)(5) must submit the certification required by Section 10322(i)(2) at project completion.

Additional Conditions: None

Points System	Max. Possible Points	Requested Points	Points Awarded
Cost Efficiency / Credit Reduction / Public Funds	20	20	20
Public Funds	20	20	20
Owner / Management Characteristics	9	9	9
General Partner Experience	6	6	6
Management Experience	3	3	3
Housing Needs	10	10	10
Site Amenities	15	15	15
Within ¼ mile of regular bus stop (or dial-a-ride service for rural set-aside)	4	4	4
Within ½ mile of public park or community center open to general public	2	2	2
Within ½ mile of a full-scale grocery/supermarket of at least 25,000 sf	4	4	4
Within 1 mile of a public middle school that site is within the attendance area	2	2	2
Within ½ mile of a pharmacy	1	1	1
In-unit high speed internet service	2	2	2
Service Amenities	10	10	10
LARGE FAMILY, SENIOR, AT-RISK HOUSING TYPES			
Service Coordinator, minimum ratio of 1 FTE to 600 bedrooms	5	5	5
Adult ed/health & wellness/skill bldg classes, minimum 60 hrs/yr instruction	5	5	5
Sustainable Building Methods	10	10	10
NEW CONSTRUCTION/ADAPTIVE REUSE			
Develop project in accordance w/requirements of: GreenPoint Rated Multifamily	5	5	5
Develop project to requirements of: GreenPoint Rated Multifamily 125	5	5	5
Lowest Income	52	52	52
Basic Targeting	50	50	50
Deeper Targeting – at least 10% of units @ 30% AMI or less	2	2	2
Readiness to Proceed	20	20	20
Miscellaneous Federal and State Policies	2	2	2
State Credit Substitution	2	2	2
Total Points	148	148	148

Please Note: If more than the maximum Site Amenity points were requested, not all amenities may have been scored and/or verified.

DO NOT RELY ON SCORING IN THIS COMPETITIVE CYCLE FOR FUTURE APPLICATIONS. ALL RE-APPLICATIONS ARE REVIEWED WITHOUT RELIANCE ON PAST SCORING.